



2016

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

LEGAL ACTION REPORT

Thursday, July 28, 2016

4th Floor North Conference Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library,
101 N. Stone, Tucson, Arizona 85701

1. Call to Order / Roll Call

Meeting called to order by Chair Majewski at 12:01PM, and a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present: Terry Majewski (Chair) Patsy Waterfall, Jim Sauer, Arthur Stables, and Sharon Chadwick

Staff: Michael Taku, Jonathan Mabry, (PDSD) Alison Miller, Ann Charles (Ward 6)

2. Approval of Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes from meeting of 7-14-16

Motion by Commissioner Waterfall, duly seconded by Commissioner Stables, to approve the Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes from meeting of 7-14-16.

Motion passed. Voice Vote 5-0

3. Courtesy Review Cases

- a. Plaza Centro Railyard-Hi Fi Kitchen, Expanded Patio Area/Roof/Structural Support to match the existing patio architecture in color and material for compatibility with Rio Nuevo Area design criteria, 345 East Congress Street- Informational Presentation. No Action Required.

Presentation by architect, Rhonda Rawson, American Design Consultants, Inc. Discussion was held. No action taken

4. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines

- a. HPZ-16-42-** Rex Residence-New Roof Dormer/Wood Windows/Asphalt Shingles/Wood Shakes Additions: South (2nd Street), West and North Elevations-211 East 2nd Street-(West University Historic Preservation Zone)

Staff Taku summarized the stages of the application and read into the record the LAR of WUHZAB from the meeting of 7/19/16 with a recommendation for approval with conditions.

Project architect, Earl Yousey, Design/Build Forum, LLC presented the proposed project re-design based on WUHZAB review comments. Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Stables, duly seconded by Commissioner Waterfall, to recommend approval of the project as presented based on revisions in response to WUHZAB review comments and subject to (1) Installation of operable or casement windows as architect deems necessary.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0.

- b. HPZ-16-56-** Smith- Existing Front Porch Enclosure [Pending Zoning Violation, T12SA00261 & HPZ-12-30; HPZ-15-61] Proposal to Restore Front Porch to the Original Configuration-600 East Speedway Boulevard (West University Historic Preservation Zone)

Staff Taku summarized the history of this long pending zoning violation and read into the record the LAR of WUHZAB from the meeting of 7/19/16 with a recommendation for approval with a condition.

Project architect, Thomas Sayler-Brown, SBBL Architecture & Planning presented a design proposal to restore the porch to its original configuration design as constantly requested by WUHZAB and PRS in previous reviews. Discussion was held. Lack of adequate historical and clear photographs was noted. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Stables, to recommend approval of the project as presented subject to

following conditions:- (1) Front stairs will be flanked by stone-covered low walls;(2) All faces of the porch wall to be covered in stone; (3) Height of wall to be brought back to original height; (4) Existing rolling shutter over front entry doors be removed;(5) Main entrance to be a pair of French doors; (6) Door to the west of main entrance to be re-installed to match historic photo submitted and (7) Minor review for above conditions prior to closing the zoning violation case and/or return to PRS if any significant changes proposed.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0.

- c. **HPZ-16-61-** HP Villas LLC-Proposed Garage/New Unit/Doors/Windows/Fence-236 East 12th Street- (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone)

Staff Taku read into the record the LAR of APHZAB from the meeting of 7/19/16 with a recommendation for approval.

Project architects, Bill Williams, Engberg Anderson Architects and Ann Lawrence presented the background and design concept of the project. Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Stables, duly seconded by Commissioner Waterfall, to recommend approval of project as presented.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0.

5. Rio Nuevo Area Review Case
UDC Section 5.12.7

RNA-16-15 La Placita Village-Redevelopment Project: Historic Samaniego House, Film Building, Stables and Residential Development-Conceptual Design Plan -110 South Church Avenue, (Rio Nuevo Area-Downtown Core Sub district)

Staff Taku summarized the project as being an attempt by applicants to get a proceed recommendation on the concept plan with the intent of returning to PRS with a design package and any significant changes.

City Preservation Officer, Dr. Mabry, read into the record his finding and concurrence by SHPO that as presented in the conceptual design (5/15/16) and site plan (6/20/16), the proposed project will have no adverse effect on the historic statuses of the three existing historic buildings to be retained.

Presentation was led by Evan Eglin alongside Teresa Vasquez, Tatyana Bresler and Matt Stuart. Discussion was held. Subcommittee was concerned that the three historic structures are not identifiable from the concept plan. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Stables, duly seconded by Commissioner Waterfall, to recommend approval of the concept plan as presented and to encourage focus on historic buildings and treatment (repair/restore to original). Additionally, emphasis on the following principles: (1) Visibility;(2) Compatibility and differentiation of historic (old) and new buildings; (3) Connectivity between historic and new buildings; (4) Integration, Transition in heights (six-story apartment) and functionality;(5) Drainage to protect historic buildings; and, (6) Streetscape and pedestrian circulation. Finally, concurs with City Preservation Officer and SHPO on a finding that the conceptual design will have no adverse effect on the historic statuses of the three existing historic buildings to be retained.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0.

6. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

a. Minor Reviews

Staff and Commissioner Chadwick conducted an on-site review in Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone on a pending solar panel application.

b. Appeals

Staff updated Subcommittee on the Barrio Historico Historic Zone Advisory Board (BHHZAB) "Intent to Appeal" PDSD approval of Case HPZ-16-39.

c. Zoning Violations

Staff continues to assist owners on abatement of violations within the City Historic Preservation Zones and Rio Nuevo Area.

d. Review Process for Approval of Complex Large-Scale and/or Multi-Phase Projects

None at this time

7. Call to the Audience (For Information Only)

No one to speak.

8. Future Agenda Items

Development of guidance for future ZA determinations of expanded development zones. Discussion was held. No action.

Due to attendance consideration, the next regularly PRS meeting was will be scheduled for 8/18/16.

9. Adjournment

1: 56 PM.